

GREENFIELD TOWN COUNCIL

Special Meeting Minutes

November 29, 2017

GCTV-15 393 Main Street

7:00 pm

CALL TO ORDER: Meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by President Allis.

President Allis stated this meeting was being recorded. If any other person present was doing the same, they must notify the chairperson at this time. It was noted the Town Council was audio recording and GCTV-15 was video recording the meeting for future broadcast.

ROLL CALL OF MEMBERS: Roll Call was taken. Councilors Childs and Leonovich were absent.

ALSO PRESENT: Mayor William Martin; Town Clerk Deborah J. Tuttle; Finance Director/Town Auditor/Town Accountant Elizabeth Braccia; Director of Administration Mark Smith; Chief Assessor Audrey Murphy; Public Safety Commission members Robert Hawkins and Adam Provost; Fire Fighter Peter McIver; Police Chief Robert Haigh; Reardon, Joyce & Akerson, PC Attorney Austin Joyce; GCTV-15 staff; Aviva Luttrell, *the Recorder*; and members of the public.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Renaud, second by Councilor Mass, it was,

VOTED: TO SUSPEND THE RULES OF PROCEDURE, 8 ORDER AND DISPOSITION OF BUSINESS.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: Councilor Burge read the following Public Hearing notice: The Greenfield Town Council will hold a public hearing on Wednesday, November 29, 2017, at 7:00 p.m., at GCTV-15, 393 Main Street, 3rd floor, to adopt a residential factor in accordance with the provisions of Massachusetts General Laws, Chapter 58, Section 1A, which shall be used by the Board of Assessors to determine the percentages of the local tax levy to be borne by each class of real and personal property. The Assessors shall provide all information and data relevant to making such determination and the fiscal effect of the available alternatives. The hearing is required under Section 56 of Chapter 40, Massachusetts General Laws.

Brickett Allis, President

Town Council

President Allis opened the Public Hearing at 7:08 pm and asked if anyone from the public wished to speak. The following members of the public spoke in favor of a single tax rate for all classes of property in Greenfield:

- John Howland, Greenfield Savings Bank CEO, 452 South Shelburne Road.
- Beth Lorenz, Greenfield business owner, 39 Sunrise Ave.
- George Gohl, business owner, 157 Montague City Road.
- Jeff Singleton, 216 Davis Street.
- Rachael Katz, Greenfield business owner, works and resides at 229-231 Main Street.
- Douglas Clarke, 39 Madison Circle, member of the Chamber of Commerce.
- Robert Maguire, 24 Prospect Ave.
- William Martin, Greenfield Mayor, 1250 Old Albany Road.
- Doug White, 237 Conway Street.
- Wendy Goodman, 529 Green River Road.
- Andrew Killeen, 104 Wells Street.
- Scott Decker, Greenfield business owner, 603 Hoosick Road Conway.
- John White, CDC Executive Director, Deerfield, Ma.
- Natalie Blais, Chamber of Commerce Executive Director, Sunderland, Ma.

- Elisabeth Braccia, Finance Director/Town Auditor/Town Accountant, Deerfield, Ma.
- David Cunningham, Greenfield business owner, 38 Main Street, Ashfield, Ma.
- Steve Capshaw, Greenfield business owner, South Hampton, Ma.
- Steve Reilly, Greenfield business owner, 10-24 Miles Street.
- Sarah Kanabay, Communications Manager for the Franklin Community Co-op.
- Melissa Winters, Greenfield business owner, 62 Purple Meadows Road, Bernardston, MA.
- Chris Sexton, Greenfield business owner, 62 Purple Meadows Road, Bernardston, MA.
- Joe Easton, Greenfield business owner, Orange, MA.
- Sammy Rahob, 15 Abbott St.
- Nancy Conant, 22 Walnut St.
- Patty Morey-Walker, 194 High St.
- Steve Golshier, Greenfield business owner, Conway, MA.

Other members of the public which spoke:

- Virginia Desogder, 43 Silver Crest Circle, spoke of the improper and ethical behavior displayed by the Town Council.

President Allis closed the Public Hearing at 8:41 PM.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Renaud, second by Councilor Mass, it was unanimously,
VOTED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE GREENFIELD TOWN COUNCIL WAIVE THE RULES OF PROCEDURE, 8 ORDER AND DISPOSITION OF BUSINESS.

MOTIONS, ORDERS, AND RESOLUTIONS

Order no. FY 18-041 A

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Burge, second by Councilor Ricketts, it was,

MOVED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE TOWN COUNCIL ADOPT A MINIMUM RESIDENTIAL FACTOR OF 1(ONE), RESULTING IN AN EQUAL TAX RATE FOR ALL CLASSES OF PROPERTY FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2018.

DISCUSSION: Councilors discussion and comments included:

- Responses to comments made during the Public Hearing.
- Wished business owners and citizens had been communicating with the Town Council for the past few years.
- Effects of split rate on businesses and citizens.
- There were fewer vacant businesses than there were homes.
- Amount of new growth needed to give residents a tax break.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Mass, second by Councilor Ricketts, it was,

MOVED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE TOWN COUNCIL ADOPT A RESIDENTIAL FACTOR OF 1 (ONE) AND A FACTOR OF 1.0808 (ONE POINT ZERO EIGHT ZERO EIGHT), FOR ALL OTHER CLASSES, COMMERCIAL INDUSTRIAL AND PERSONAL PROPERTY, FOR FISCAL YEAR 2018.

DISCUSSION: Councilors discussion and comments included:

- Comments from business owners and residents regarding the split rate.
- It's time to give the homeowners a tax break.
- Mass Municipal recommendations for building businesses.
- EDC should discuss the process for setting tax classification.

- 1.0808 rate would mean a lot to many residents.
- Explanation of which businesses would fit into the classification of a “small business.”
- Effects on future building projects if the tax payers don’t see any relief.
- Ridiculous spending with this administration; citizens cannot afford this spending.

President Allis stated a vote on the proposed amendment would be taken.

It was by majority roll call, 6 yes and 4 no,

VOTED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE TOWN COUNCIL ADOPT A RESIDENTIAL FACTOR OF 1 (ONE) AND A FACTOR OF 1.0808 (ONE POINT ZERO EIGHT ZERO EIGHT), FOR ALL OTHER CLASSES, COMMERCIAL INDUSTRIAL AND PERSONAL PROPERTY, FOR FISCAL YEAR 2018.

DISCUSSION: Discussion on the motion as amended included:

- To go back to a factor of one, budget cuts would be required.
- This amendment was a good compromise.

It was majority roll call, 6 yes and 4 no,

VOTED: TO APPROVE ORDER NO. FY 18 -041 A AS AMENDED.

Order no. FY 18-041 B

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Burge, second by Councilor Pyfrom, it was,

MOVED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE TOWN COUNCIL VOTES THAT NO RESIDENTIAL EXEMPTION BE ADOPTED FOR FISCAL YEAR 2018.

DISCUSSION: Councilor Mass stated the Legal opinion received indicated this vote stood. And the Council could not bring it back up for 10 days as indicated by Charter.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Mass, second by Councilor Ricketts, it was unanimously,

TABLED: ORDER NO. FY 18 -041 B.

Order no. FY 18-041 C

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Burge, second by Councilor Pyfrom, it was,

MOVED: THAT IT BE ORDERED, THAT THE TOWN COUNCIL VOTES THAT NO SMALL COMMERCIAL EXEMPTION BE ADOPTED FOR FISCAL YEAR 2018.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Ricketts, second by Councilor Wainstein, it was by show of hands 3 yes and 8 no,

DEFEATED: TO TABLE ORDER NO. FY 18 -041 C.

DISCUSSION: President Allis explained the need for the Council to vote on this order. He noted the Town Council would have to place a percentage (%) between one (1) to ten (10) for a small commercial exemption if an exemption was wanted. Discussion was held regarding the effects and who would benefit from a small business exemption.

It was by majority 8 yes and 2 no,

VOTED: TO APPROVE ORDER NO. FY 18 -041 C.

President Allis called the Town Council into recess at 9:43 pm.

President Allis called the Town Council out of recess at 9:54 pm.

President Allis explained the process to be undertaken when receiving information requested associated with Charter Section 2-7: Access to Information (a).

Ms. Tuttle asked the Mayor: Raise your right hand, do you swear to tell the truth the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help you God.

Mayor Martin - I do.

Mayor Martin read the attached "Exhibit A."

President Allis – I think it would be appropriate to have all of the questions answered first and then we will have follow up questions unless the Council wishes to have follow up questions to the mayor directly at this point.

Councilor Mass – I defer to the rest of the Council but while I have his answers fresh in my mind I would like to ask questions of the Mayor.

President Allis – alright we will take up the questions now than, that's fine. So the questions must be related to or, what was the terminology, reasonably related to the questions that were provided. So follow up questions must be related to the questions provided. Everyone remembers that. As I stated, I'm going to go last and will relinquish my Chair to Councilor Renaud at that point. So, the floor is open to any Councilor who wishes to ask follow up questions to these initial questions.

Councilor Mass - Mr. Mayor, your answer to question nine regarding traffic, parking zones, are you not aware of the License Commissions authority to establish parking spaces and authorize them to be blocked off and restructured under our current form of government.

Mayor Martin – would you repeat that question.

Councilor Mass - are you not aware of the License Commissions role in establishing where parking spaces exist and where they shouldn't exist and where they, how long those spaces can be under our current form of government.

Mayor Martin – the question dealt with parking zones not parking spaces.

Councilor Mass – so you interpret that as zones, but you do recognize the authority of the license commission and that roll.

Mayor Martin – I do.

Councilor Mass - do you believe that it would be advisable to create a parking, get a parking commission ordinance in place where a parking commission actually has some teeth and authority, rather than just an advisory capacity.

Mayor Martin – I would take that under advisement. We've got some other planning to do with parking.

Councilor Mass - so you don't believe, you believe that yourself and the Public Works Director at your direction should have sole authority over parking in Greenfield, ultimately.

Mayor Martin – I didn't say that did I. Councilor Mass I think your miss interpreting my answer. So in addition the parking and traffic commission has a duty and responsibility under section 163 B to advise the Mayor on matters. So the planning and traffic commission, existing, provides for that information to do with the streets, the parking and the traffic.

Councilor Mass – do you feel bound to follow their recommendations.

Mayor Martin – Ahh, ya, they are the ones dealing with the situation. I'm not inclined to micromanage those other departments.

Councilor Mass - are you aware of how parking enforcement is, when changes to policy related to parking enforcement are taken place.

Mayor Martin – no.

Councilor Mass – you're not.

Mayor Martin – no.

Councilor Mass - no one advises you of that.

Mayor Martin – no, pardon.

Councilor Mass - no one advises you of the change to parking enforcement policies.

Mayor Martin – parking enforcement policies come through the Chief of Police at this point, for a, and traffic. The enforcement officers, parking enforcement officer and the DPW. So all three of those groups are involved in policy.

Councilor Mass – do they notify you when they change the policy.

Mayor Martin – I believe so.

Councilor Mass - do you approve those changes.

Mayor Martin – we haven't had any changes in the recent months except that we are working, putting together the parking policy for the accreditation for the police department.

Councilor Mass – do you believe there was a change in policy in January when we started ticketing permit holders for being in a permitted zone on Saturdays, was that a change.

Mayor Martin – yup I do recall.

Councilor Mass - were you aware that change had been made.

Mayor Martin – I recommended that change.

Councilor Mass – you did recommend that change. And did you notify the permit holders of the change.

Mayor Martin – we would have to check, I did not, no.

Councilor Mass – did anyone.

Mayor Martin – permit holders are the accountant and the treasures.

Councilor Mass – no, no, no the parking permit holders, people who have parking permits, when we changed the policy to enforce, to start ticketing people who had permits in permitted lots on Saturdays, in their permitted lot. When that change was made did you notify the people who had the permits?

Mayor Martin – I'm not prepared to answer that question, or your question is off line. We are talking number 9 parking zones and you asked for the a, cite any lawful statute that to back up your opinion. This is one lawful statute, there may be other lawful statutes that I have not included or have not looked into. So if you present another question I'll get the answerer for you.

Councilor Mass – you indicated I had an interaction with Audrey LaBonte, correct.

Mayor Martin – is that another number? What number are you talking about?

Councilor Mass - That's the subject of the investigation, or one of the subjects of the investigation,

Mayor Martin – the question you are going to ask me is going to come from a number I have here. So what number of the question that you ask?

Councilor Mass - there was a complaint related to, in February.

Mayor Martin – is that the situation where you intimidated and bullied the office manager in February.

Councilor Mass - did you receive any complaint of any kind in February related to my interaction with the office manager

Mayor Martin – yes I did

Councilor Mass - and my interaction with the office manager was about a, about parking policy, correct.

Mayor Martin – I don't recall, but we'll be able to review that tonight, that's not on here.

Councilor Mass - do you, isn't this what I provided to the parking a, and I can provide a copy of this to you, isn't this what I provided to your assistant at your request.

Mayor Martin – is this number 15 we are dealing with number 15.

Councilor Mass - at your request, ya, yes you asked me to provide a copy of Mr. Lang's permit because you said you didn't know what the poli, you didn't know that this enforcement was going on.

Mayor Martin – I obviously, as you heard from many, we go through literally thousands of tickets, so I don't know the ticket. I do remember the situation with Mr. Lang. you were representing him and wanted his ticket um, wanted the signage changed because his ticket didn't make sense.

Councilor Mass - did I, did you request that I provide the ticket to you.

Mayor Martin – I may have. Why did you provide it to me.

Councilor Mass - Mr. Mayor, and I'm supposed to be asking questions of you, but I would be happy to answer your question. I provided it to you because you asked me for it because you said you didn't know

that change had been made and you didn't know what was going on. But you just testified that you recommended that change.

Mayor Martin – Rather I testified that I didn't have all the information.

Both Mayor Martin and Councilor Mass spoke at the same time, talking over the each other:

Mayor Martin - But I, who were you trying, what is your question. Instead of circumventing the actual question what is it Councilor Mass you want to ask.

Councilor Mass – Who made, my question is who made, who made the decision, who made.

Councilor Mass – Who made the decision to start ticketing people on Saturdays who were permit holders in permitted spots.

Mayor Martin – that was a miss understanding as we declared after you brought it forward. The clarification of the parking permit on a special, if you have a parking permit for one lot that is where you park. If you park in another lot you get a ticket. We are in the process of changing that. I don't recall the exact, who we spoke to, when it occurred, but a, that was the situation.

Councilor Mass - so you don't know who provided the training to the parking enforcement.

Mayor Martin – I don't recall, I don't recall.

Councilor Mass – you don't recall.

Mayor Martin – but put that question in writing again and I'll find out, that specific question.

Councilor Mass - I would like to know that, um, Mr. Mayor you indicated on number 12 “ have you ever used bullying intimidation threats retribution against any town employee or town councilor” you indicated no, is that correct.

Mayor Martin – that is correct.

Councilor Mass - in number three you define bullying behavior as the belief, the, as “aggressive physical contact, words or actions to cause another person injury or discomfort” is that correct.

Mayor Martin – that is true.

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor, do you believe that you have never used words or actions to cause another person who is a town employee or Town Councilor personal injury or discomfort.

Mayor Martin – why don't you ask that again.

Councilor Mass – do you believe that you have never used words.

Mayor Martin – yes.

Councilor Mass - or.

Mayor Martin – yes, I didn't know how you were asking the question, but I answered.

Councilor Mass – I'm sorry what.

Mayor Martin – I didn't know how you were asking the question, yes is the answer.

Both Mayor Martin and Councilor Mass spoke at the same time, talking over the each other:

Councilor Mass – so yes you've never used words.

Mayor Martin – I believe I have not, right.

Councilor Mass – I still have a few more questions Councilor Wainstein, I'm, not many more.

Councilor Wainstein – President Allis, I mean, there has to be an opportunity for other Council members to have an opportunity to object. There has to be because what was happening now is I feel like that last question, I know what we talked about in the beginning but I feel like that last question is outside of the scope of the investigation should the Mayor's accusation.

President Allis – its directly related to the question that was posed to the Mayor.

Councilor Wainstein – I don't agree. I mean I think that this is outside that scope.

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor, you indicated that you conducted an investigation related to the incident with President Allis, is that correct.

Mayor Martin – what number are we on.

Councilor Mass - um you said that you immediately investigated; number 13, “immediately investigate the situation and responded within five days.”

Mayor Martin – number 13 you said.

Councilor Mass – yes, number 13.

Mayor Martin – “if a direct verbal assault was a threat.”

Councilor Mass – no number 13, on page three asks, you’ve wrote “I immediately investigated the situation and responded within five days,” is that correct.

Mayor Martin – yes.

Councilor Mass – did your investigation include speaking with President Allis.

Mayor Martin – no.

Councilor Mass – when there are allegations of misconduct between two employees in the town is it your normal policy, as part of an investigation, not to talk to all the parties involved in that incident.

Mayor Martin – what two employees are you talking about?

Councilor Mass – any two employees.

Mayor Martin – well we are talking about the Chief of Police and the President of the Council

Councilor Mass – yes.

Mayor Martin – one is a town employee and one is not.

Councilor Mass - you don’t recognize the President of the Town Council as a town employee.

Mayor Martin – and I don’t recognize the Mayor of Greenfield as a town employee.

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor I think you’re mistaken. I think both the President of the Council and the Mayor are both town employees and are subject to, rules of ethics, sexual harassment policies, W-2’s all the things that go with an employee. I think your making, I I think you need to reevaluate that.

Mayor Martin – well as recently as yesterday I confirmed that I am not a town employee.

Councilor Mass - I think you’re mistaken Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Martin – I think you’re mistaken so we will have two attorneys talk to each other.

Councilor Mass - Mr. Mayor, in any investigation where there are two sides to a story, do you think it makes sense to get both sides.

Mayor Martin – I think it makes sense to act on a complaint.

Both Mayor Martin and Councilor Mass spoke at the same time, talking over the each other:

Councilor Mass - without knowing whether or not that complaint is correct.

Mayor Martin – when you’re dealing with a.

Mayor Martin - Human Resource and two municipal employees is a different situation and at each situation is taken under these specific circumstances of those situations. This was a complaint from a department head to the Mayor of a verbal attack by the President of the City Council.

Councilor Mass - and you didn’t think it was important to talk to the City Council to find out what the circumstances were.

Mayor Martin – I thought it was more important alert the City Council that the Mayor was aware of the situation and considered that type of dialog between a department head and the President of the Council as inappropriate; which I did in the letter.

Councilor Mass – how did you confirm.

Mayor Martin – can we read the letter maybe that would help some of the Councilors understand.

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor we’ve received the letter.

Mayor Martin – ok.

Councilor Mass – how did you confirm the veracity of the Chief of Polices complaint?

Mayor Martin – how did I consider the veracity of the Chief of Polices complaint?

Councilor Mass - how did you confirm that he was telling you the truth?

Mayor Martin – how did I, how would I have confirmed that he was lying.

Councilor Mass – well.

Mayor Martin - so I make a judgment call, I would trust the Chief of Police reporting such an incident, and then I would challenge others to prove that that report is invalid.

Councilor Mass - and that challenge is, at any point did you challenge the President to prove that that report was invalid?

Mayor Martin – that is not up to me to request, I mean anyone can challenge it apparently, the President didn’t. He can let me know at some other time, but apparently the President did challenge it.

Councilor Mass – I have no further questions.

President Allis – Councilor Pyfrom.

Councilor Pyfrom – I think he might have answered this on 14 but I'm going to ask it again about, um, why a meeting was not called immediately, um, and you had stated you were out of town, then you conducted an investigation. But it wasn't conducted for all parties involved. I think in all fairness all parties should have come together and met before this email went to the *Recorder*. I think most, most management, upper management, um, businesses when there's conflict of interest there is a meeting called for all parties, and it, it looks like the meeting was just between you and the Chief, is that correct.

Mayor Martin – um, you're on question what number.

Councilor Pyfrom - 14, I'm back on 14

Mayor Martin – 14.

Councilor Pyfrom – ya.

Mayor Martin – and, so, when it occurred, I wasn't in town, it was reported to the Acting Mayor.

Councilor Pyfrom – right.

Mayor Martin - when I did find out, when I returned somewhere around October 31st that's when I began the investigation. So your saying that at that time I should bring all the parties together and discuss a, what?

Councilor Pyfrom - discuss the incident that took place. I mean that's standard practice for upper management to call a meeting when there is um ya know accusation, allegations of, usually.

Mayor Martin – I think that is probably a fair assessment, but there was a choice to be made, and I, the choice I made was to send a letter to the President of the Council, under, and you have the letter and you've apparently read it.

Councilor Pyfrom – I've read everything.

Mayor Martin - so that's quiet, quite explanatory, in the letter of exactly what happened and what my actions were.

Councilor Pyfrom – Yes, so I was just asking why all parties, like question 14 states, why were not all parties part of a meeting to hash it out, to figure out what went wrong before a letter got sent to the press.

Mayor Martin - So I think that a letter would be a first step, that's the way I manage, a letter would be the first step. If they want to get together, if there is continued dialog, but if a it is uncivil or accusatory than I don't think we are going to get parties together. But if it's a want to understand how we communicate, now I've made that quite clear with the executive order, the Executive Order was that the Council follows the procedure which goes up to the Council President to contact the Mayor and then get all the questions that we get from the departments. That is to prevent all the Councilors from contacting all of the municipal department heads and others for special information from them, taking them away from their normal job. So, that has been, um, not followed over a period of time, so this is a chance to a, an opportunity again to go back and lets, lets have that orderly communication between the Legislative and the Executive.

Councilor Pyfrom - so again, um, the letter that you submitted with everything that we've all read should have also had a letter inviting to investigate with all parties.

Both Mayor Martin and Councilor Pyfrom spoke at the same time, talking over the each other:

Mayor Martin - no that's what we do, no we are doing that now in a way, and then we might do it later on if it looks feasible.

Councilor Pyfrom - all parties involved, we are doing it now, but however.

Councilor Pyfrom – in management I think we all call parties together first before we submit a letter. And a letter would be to ask all parties to come together.

Mayor Martin - I consider that a judgment call and I made my judgment and I stand by what I did.

Councilor Pyfrom – ok, I'm not going against that I'm just asking questions. I did have another question on; I guess 17 and 18 are kind of the same, um. If the Clerk was out of the office when the email was sent what is the next chain of command and who gets, shouldn't there be emails carbon copied to the next chain in command. Who's the next when the Clerk is out of office? There's how many people in the Clerk's office?

Mayor Martin – four, including the Clerk.

Councilor Pyfrom - and when the Clerk is out you stated that you didn't know that she was leaving early, for the day. Where would that email have gone in addition to the Clerk?

Mayor Martin - so Councilor you ask a good question: one it has been said several years ago, probably 10 years ago, the Council is not an employer, the Town Council is not an employer. So the Town Clerk who is

also Clerk to the Council is an employee of the Town, not of the Council. So, that's been a legal opinion for a decade at least now. So, the department head which is the Town Clerk is also under a contract directly with the Mayor so that process should have been communicated. The Clerk should have communicated to the um Mayor's Office that she wasn't there. Often she does that, I don't, I can't recall a time that she hasn't, but when we send emails to the Town Clerk, Deb Tuttle, it's assumed that it goes other places. I don't deal with the direct communication with Karen and Lindsay and Mark, but there is a, if Deb isn't there, I'm going to deal with real people, if Deb isn't there I would assume it gets relayed to someone else for action and activity, I don't know.

Councilor Pyfrom - one more question.

Mayor Martin - Sure.

Councilor Pyfrom - in that mix, um, the Clerk works for the Mayor, correct.

Mayor Martin - right.

Councilor Pyfrom - how do you communicate with the Clerk when she needs to leave early for the day, how do you, usually when I leave early or when I'm out people know, laugh.

Mayor Martin - that's um, the Clerk notifies the Mayor's office, that's what the, all the "Non-represented" employees do. That's what "NR" contract are, um, Greenfield has not enjoyed the best accuracy of maintaining control or validity of all earned time off and used.

Councilor Pyfrom - thank you.

Mayor Martin - so that's a project.

Councilor Pyfrom - thank you.

President Allis - Councilor Renaud.

Councilor Renaud - Mayor Martin on question 19, um, you said that the Mayor's Office sent the letter to the press, so just following what Councilor Pyfrom was saying, there was not an investigation, you did not get President Allis side of the story. So why were you compelled to send a letter to the press, um, what compelled you to do that.

Mayor Martin - we often send communications to the press.

Councilor Renaud - every single email you send, do you send it to the press as well.

Mayor Martin - not every single email.

Councilor Renaud - umhum, was there a particular reason this one why you wanted to make it public information.

Mayor Martin - it was public information.

Councilor Renaud - I mean by the press making it very very public.

Mayor Martin - is there a particular reason why I should cover it up.

Councilor Renaud - is this making you angry Mayor Martin, me asking you this question.

Mayor Martin - no, no, no, not at all.

Councilor Renaud - because you appear to be getting angry, I'm just asking a question Mayor Martin.

Mayor Martin - and I'm just answering Councilor Renaud.

Councilor Renaud - I'm done.

Councilor Mass - point of order Mr. President.

President Allis - yes.

Councilor Mass - I believe Councilor Renaud asked the question to which the Mayor responded with a question. I don't know that that is an answer. Is that, is that how, typically when I ask questions of people who are under oath they are directed to, when something, when you ask a question and someone answers something else it's considered nonresponsive. I'm wondering if you consider the answer of the Mayor to Councilor Renaud's question as responsive.

President Allis - could you repeat your response to Councilor Renaud.

Mayor Martin - yes.

President Allis - thank you repeat the question too please.

Councilor Renaud - why did you send the letter to the press, why did you want to make this so public?

Mayor Martin - oh, ok, getting back to that, thanks, um the email was sent to the press, that's kind of a normal process and this was an incident out the um regular events of the day, um the, the fact that it was

already sent to the office in October or on the toward the end by the Chief, its public information. That's what I meant by its already public information

Councilor Renaud – no further questions from me.

President Allis- any further questions from anybody else.

Councilor Wainstein – Mayor, um, it would be helpful for me if you refreshed my memory by reading out loud Chief Haigh's letter.

President Allis – I believe Chief Haigh could read his letter when he is up.

Councilor Wainstein – I didn't see him here, sorry.

President Allis – are there anymore questions for the Mayor? At this point I will allow Councilor Renaud to assume the Chairmanship so that I can ask my questions. So Councilor Renaud, I guess we can move.

(Councilor Renaud and President Allis switched seats. A packet of pictures from President Allis was put on the table for the Mayor and Chief Haigh to use as reference during the conversation)

President Allis – do I have the floor?

Councilor Renaud – yes, President Allis you have the floor.

President Allis – so just a couple of clarifying questions on your answers. Thee, number 18 is there a written policy that requires the Clerk to alert you to when she is not there? Or if she is going to leave early.

Mayor Martin – I have to review the contract, I don't know.

President Allis – so you're unsure, ok, has it been past practice that she always tells you if she is leaving early or is it typical past practice that she does not tell you that she is leaving early.

Mayor Martin - I think we had to conversation early after her appointment, her new appointment, it was to discuss, at that time, that she was an employee of the town and that a thee communication was with the Mayor's Office.

President Allis – Has she ever been disciplined for leaving early and not letting you know? Ever, has she ever been disciplined by you for leaving early and not telling you?

Mayor Martin – no.

President Allis - ok, so she has never been disciplined for that before.

Mayor Martin – no.

President Allis - ok thank you. So with that cleared up because I just, I wanted to make sure we cleared those questions up, I would just like to read something really quickly, if that's ok to read this involves what I'm going to ask: so I've been a Councilor for 16 years and I've always made every decision that I make in the best interest of the town and for the community, um, when I see issues arise, I try to fix them and I try to help come to thee, to the place that I think is the right place to be when those issues arrive, arise. Um, by virtue of the fact that I'm an elected official I have come to expect that I will never be able to satisfy everybody and that's, you can't just satisfy everybody, um however I've always weighed the good and the bad of a, the good of the many over the good of the few and that's how I always operate, is that you, I do the best work for the most amount of people I can. With that, um, thee issue and thee investigation that happening over my conduct with the Chief, I have admitted was inappropriate and I admitted was in error and that um the judgment that I used was incorrect. And I make an apology, the Chief um believes that it was vain in nature and I don't believe that but be that as it may this is how he feels about it that's fine. Um and thee, the way I handled the situation was inappropriate and I admitted that and I apologized and I, I continue to apologize for the way that I handled myself. That said the issues that were underlying caused me to become angry about what was going on and the anger was triggered, yes by a parking ticket, but not by a parking ticket issued to me. It was by parking tickets issued to other people and that is the issue that I saw that we have with parking enforcement, is that there was selective ticketing, in my opinion. I did not bully anybody I did not intimidate anybody, I was upset at what was going on and frankly the issues that I have been bringing to the attention of the Police Department and the Fire Department many many times which I will go over in a minute was, um, it got to a boiling point I couldn't understand why something wasn't being done. So with that said I just, I do want to apologize to everybody for the way I handled the situation because I, it was not the right way to handle the situation. But that notwithstanding we have some serious policy issues that we have to talk about, that we need to be talking about.

So in your answers to your questions, number, hang on I have to find it, um sorry, it's here, there is a question on here that talks about incomplete signage and signage that is incorrect that you cannot issue tickets due to.

Mayor Martin – number six.

President Allis - number six, thank you I appreciate that. And everybody has a copy of the photographs in front of them. So in relation to that particular question, on exhibit one, is, do you believe that the signage in exhibit one is actually incorrect or or that there is a reason that you could not ticket someone for for for this violation, or these three violations. Picture number one right on the front.

Mayor Martin – ya, I was told from the signage, from the sign to the bridge.

President Allis – from the sign to the bridge you would agree that is no parking zone.

Mayor Martin - from the sign to the bridge is a no ticketed zone, if you want to put it that way. So we can't give tickets in that area because we don't have signage.

President Allis – so the sign on the poll that says no parking with an arrow, that's not an official sign.

Mayor Martin – the green one?

President Allis - well the green one says “fairgrounds” the one below it in red letters says “no parking” with an arrow, is that correct?

Mayor Martin – ok um, I don't know, I don't walk the beat.

President Allis – well ok but.

Mayor Martin - I don't know.

President Allis - I'm just, it's in relation to question number six you said if there was inconsistent signage. I'm just do you believe when there is a no parking sign that you should not be parking there in general.

Mayor Martin – yes.

President Allis - ok, so thank you for saying that so now I can skip through exhibit two which is the same picture with more cars parked there, exhibit three with more cars parked there, all on different days, exhibit four with, actually ill do exhibit four because exhibit four, do you believe that parking left wheel to the curb, if, if, so you believe that there needs to be signage for someone not to park left wheel to the curb.

Mayor Martin – I got to be honest with you, I don't know.

President Allis – you don't know, ok, I'll save that one for the Chief.

Mayor Martin – you can ask me a lot of vehicle violation questions chances are I'm not going to know.

President Allis – ok ill save it for the Chief, that's ok, no problem its ok. Um, so, if in fact there is a no parking sign and there are people parked there do you believe they should be ticketed? This is in relation to question six; if there is a no parking zone and someone is parked in it do you believe they should be ticketed.

Mayor Martin – if there is a violation, a.

President Allis – they should be ticketed.

Mayor Martin - the PEO's (Parking Enforcement Officers) ticket.

President Allis – so thank you for that, um. I've actually, ya know, asked a lot of the questions about when you knew of my personal situation, quite frankly, I guess it really doesn't matter what when you knew because I know when you knew, so it's ok, um and I just, in my response, in my letter that I responded to you, it, it, it, it states how I feel about what, what you did with your letter and you can do with it what you like. Um but what.

Mayor Martin – you should realize that on October 31st there was, that's when I talked with the Chief of Police.

President Allis – and, and, and do you believe that the chief knew that I was in the hospital then?

Mayor Martin – no I was told you had a child later on.

President Allis – Oh, ok, ok then, he didn't give you full information because he knew. So um in the last picture, is this “no parking” sign a town “no parking” sign or is this the confusing signage that you speak of in question six. Last page, last page of your pamphlet.

Mayor Martin – I've got more pictures than you. The last page is a ticket.

Councilor Mass – it's the second to the last page.

Mayor Martin - which one?

President Allis – second to the last page, I’m sorry, second to last page.

Mayor Martin – the TEREX machine?

President Allis – the sign that says “no parking” is that a town placed sign or is that one of the confusing signs that you can’t ticket for?

Mayor Martin – oh on the cone.

President Allis – Yes on the cone and there is four of them, this is just a picture of one.

Mayor Martin – I assume that’s the contractor.

President Allis - it is but are they allowed to place signs then in the road of “no parking” signs.

Mayor Martin – I don’t know.

President Allis – you don’t, ok that’s fine. Um and in exhibit 11, it should be probably page 11, I would think, this is a picture of that same sign pole with the confusing signage with the “no parking” sign missing. In question number, question number nine it states that the parking and traffic commission has the duty to advise the Mayor on matters of parking excreta and that the DPW removes and puts up signs. On November 13th this “no parking” sign was removed. Can you tell me when the vote of the Parking and Traffic Commission was that removed that sign?

Mayor Martin – I’m not aware of.

President Allis - Not aware of a vote.

Mayor Martin – no, not aware of the sign being there or being removed.

President Allis – ok well it clearly is in one picture that’s dated October 10th and it is not in the picture dated November 13th so clearly it was removed.

Councilor Mass – Councilor Renaud.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass - may I interject with a question.

Councilor Renaud – sure.

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor you indicated that you had a, you conducted an investigation with the Chief of Police about a complaint that the Council President made to the Chief of Police and the inappropriate manner in which he made that. That investigation did not also include the bases of President Allis’s complaint and what he was complaining about, you didn’t ask what he was upset about and try to get to the bottom of that as well.

Mayor Martin – Councilor Mass the issue was the parking on Deerfield Street it had nothing to do with signage on Bank Row. The original conversation between the President and the Chief had to do with a ticket given on Deerfield Street.

Councilor Mass – So that is all the Chief of Police told you that the complaint was about.

Mayor Martin - right.

Councilor Mass – thank you.

Councilor Renaud – President Allis.

President Allis – Yup thank you, um, well I guess, I would have hoped that your investigation would have talked to me because there was much more, thee, I’m not going to use the exact language because we are on TV, but it went something to the effect of “why are you ticketing me on Deerfield Street when you’re refusing to ticket everyone on Bank Row” that’s what I said, that’s what I said on phone conversation, and yes there were expletives, but that’s what I said. So you didn’t get the full story, cuz you didn’t, what I’m telling you right now is not what was told, relayed to you, or was it just what was in his letter.

Mayor Martin – just what was in the letter, but, I’m not dealing with a parking situation, we are dealing with behavior, communication between the President of the Council and the Chief of Police.

President Allis – actually in all due respect the questions hear actually do refer to the parking situation and that’s why I put those questions in there.

Mayor Martin – that’s why most of the questions are yours, I know ya. I understand.

President Allis – yes most of them are mine. But there were other Councilors that submitted questions as well. Um, so ya I mean, I guess, um, I’m afraid that the answers to some of these questions are in fact, um, somewhat incorrect or potentially just something that maybe you didn’t realize when you answered the

questions that, is a, ya that, that's that, I'll get to the rest of my stuff with the Chief because I have plenty more, so, thank, that's all I have thank you.

Councilor Renaud – does anybody else have any questions? Councilor Burge.

Councilor Burge – Mayor Martin, I want to go back to the question on number three “what do you believe is the definition of bullying behavior” and you stated that the definition was “as described by the American Psychological Association” and it mentions “contact, words causing discomfort” um, I've done a lot of research on bullying behavior and I believe that body language is, I believe 80% maybe of um of communication so in just your mere, the mere fact that you are the Mayor and you have the power to fire anyone in your office. If if your body language says, causes some discomfort to any of your employees that can be perceived as a um, a bullying behavior. So if there is perception in your office or by any of your town employees' maybe, maybe we can work on that. Because I have heard a lot of, you know, rumblings should I say about um your, how should I say, your body language just um being intimidating, um, so I would like to explore that with you at another point, um, if that is ok with you.

Mayor Martin – Um, Councilor Burge.

Councilor Burge - Yes.

Mayor Martin – the short answer is no thank you I don't need you to explore that with me. The longer answer is um for nearly a dozen years I was a certified psychiatric mental health nurse, I'm very familiar with body language, particularly aggressive body language. I would say that your estimate is far off, ya know verbal and eye and facial and fist are the proponents of the body, parts of the body, are looked at closely to anticipate what is coming next. Your idea that “you” would need to work with “me” is um somewhat strange. The idea that a um, that, the, it just, it's a very strange, a strange proposition from you. So um I do and have gone through therapy over a number of years as a combat veteran and with veterans, I lead groups and was part of groups and um I'm very aware of where I am all the time and um thee, I think maybe you should understand how a management is. There are the thresholds of a management um obligations and responsibilities um and there are bullying situations and intimidation and um other types of aggressive behavior verbal and physical. So I think that's who we try to eliminate all of that from the work place. We have had trainings from HR for all of the employees, um, I think in 2015. I know Councilor Mass indicated what, what kind of training do “we” have or “I” have, um, I've had this training, I go through the same training, some of the employees do, but I am not an employee, I'll get that settled by someone. Um, I also um, everyone I think does the ethics, a, ya know we do a number of different types of training, so, if there is a situation where someone is feeling intimidated by another person's body language can you imagine how that other person must feel not being intimidating. So it's a very slippery sloop for accusing somebody of “I'm fearful of your body language.”

Councilors Renaud, Burge and Mass all spoke at the same time:

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass oh I'm sorry, Councilor Burge you have, Im sorry.

Councilor Burge – I'm not accusing you

Councilor Mass – I defer to Councilor Burge.

Councilor Renaud – go ahead Councilor Burge.

Councilor Burge – Yes, I'm not accusing you of anything, ok, what I'm saying to you is you said at one point that perception, ya know someone, someone can perceive something to be a certain way. If people are perceiving your interactions at some, at some point as being bullying tactics. Then maybe we can talk about that. I'm just, as a fellow veteran of the Vietnam era, I'm very aware as to how we can be perceived. People think I'm really mean, but everybody knows that I'm really not, right, so that's what I was offering. No disrespect meant to you, ok.

Mayor Martin - I think we'd have to be more specific I guess to the conversation instead of the hypothetical environment your creating.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass - Mr. President, Mr. Mayor, first of all I very much appreciate what you just said that about an employ, about someone may perceive that someone is acting a little bullying while that person may not themselves intend that at all, I think that is a correct assessment. Um my question for you Mr. Mayor is you have indicated reputedly, not just in this meeting but in previous meetings and now you've given us a

definition of what bullying is that you have never bullied any town employee. Why is it then that so many Town Councilors have heard from so many town employees that they feel bullied by you?

Mayor Martin – I can answer that question and I would only say if I've been um, why hasn't there ever been a report to me or why hasn't there been a report to somebody else to me.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Mayor Martin – and I think the definition of bullying is something that is very difficult. The federal government hasn't defined it. The state government has been talking about it for a while and trying to ah create some type of definitions for the workplace. So it's it's it's a slippery sloop in some conversations that's why you always try to maintain an open safe environment, workplace environment and communications channels for everybody.

Vice-President Mass – I appreciate that Mr. Mayor that is a reasonable assessment. Do you think it is possible that those town employees who aren't reporting it to you are fearful of what might happen if they do report it and what might we do to create a more open channel of communication where people who have concerns about you specifically can bring those forward so that you can react to them and and do a better job as Mayor and I'm not saying every accusation would be correct but so that at least you would have an understanding of those people who have concerns and be able to address those concerns.

Mayor Martin – um and I'm serious, how bout we pick a one day a month at a certain time, in the conference room where anybody can come in and critique the Mayor on manners, language, projects, spending any other type of complaints that anyone might have. Would that be a a direct open channel.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass – I appreciate that offer Mr. Mayor and I I do believe that is an open channel. My question how is any employee who is going to participate in that not be fearful of that you might and I'm not saying that you would, but how how how can they be assured that you might not retaliate for that constructive criticism that they give you.

Mayor Martin – ah ya know fear and anxiety are two main main characteristics of humans um fear is defined as a reaction that you have because you know the outcome anxiety is the anxiousness you have because you don't know the outcome. So that's the difference between fear and anxiety. When when you have a, when you find out that what your anxiety is is not true then you don't have the fear and the anxiousness. It's it's a very ya know it's a long story but ya know it's the General Anxiety Syndrome by Hans Selye its it's very interesting to read and to learn and it helps people with coping mechanisms it helps people who have anxiety and things that might happen or they think they might happen. May I share a story with you, would that be alright, Madam Chair.

Councilor Renaud – yes.

Mayor Martin – um I tell this um, I tell this to younger people and I think I made it up but I may have heard it from somewhere else and think I made it up. So um there is this person driving down the street and they run out of gas. And so, it's a man and a woman and a, they say one of us has to stay with the car and one of us has to go get gas. And so the man says you stay with the car because you're taking care vehicle ill walk the long distance to find a gas station or a house. So he takes the gas can and he starts walking. And the more he walks he says, "jeez, I should have got gas some other time." "I should have brought an extra gas tank in the car." He keeps walking then he sees a light on a farm house and he walks to the farm house and it's a long driveway. He's walking up he's, "oh good, they must have gas there they've got tractors and all types of things, must be a lot of gas," so he keeps walking and he gets closer and he says, "jeez I don't know maybe they are not happy people maybe they are miserable people maybe they are going to do something to me anyways," so he keeps walking and he says "maybe they don't have gas or they just won't give it to me or they are going to charge me to much." And he gets close to the house and he says "I don't know why im hear I should have gone to another house. And you get up and you knock on the door and the person comes to the door and the man says "I don't want your dam gas I'm leaving." So you went from a a a certain, follow the situation of the mind set where you created your own anxiety than you reacted to nothing that was real but you reacted to the anxiety that happened that you created and you said "forget your gas I'm leaving." The point of that is sometimes our anxiety gets us to a level where we respond to it ourselves and its nothing more than what we've done. So on a, as Councilor Berge was alluding to

sometimes that anxiety is not there and you can, before you even go up the driveway your already saying “oh I’m going to run because I know he’s got gas, I know they have gas there.” So you don’t have a, don’t have the uncomfortable discomfort as is the definition in the APA with a someone because you maintain and coop with some defensive mechanism that you’ve learned so you don’t have that anxiety. So, what is the point of all of this, the point is that everyone has different levels of anxiety, so, the perception is a different level.

Councilor Renaud – President Allis you had your hand up.

President Allis – ill defer to Councilor Wainstein or Councilor Mass or Councilor Burge.

Councilor Renaud – let’s do Councilor Wainstein and then Councilor Pyfrom.

Councilor Wainstein – Mr. Mayor I hate to hate to be Debbie Downer but I’ve know that story for a long time.

Mayor Martin – oh I did hear

Councilor Wainstein – I’m sorry, I always heard it as a guy breaks down on a back country road, he walks to the farm where he walks, he’s not going, ya know. Maybe you did make it up. Reaching back to the letter that a the Chief wrote I I admit that I don’t remember all that much about it but wasn’t there and correct me if im wrong wasn’t there a suggestion that funding would be cut if, am I wrong or right about that?

Mayor Martin - no your right about that.

Councilor Wainstein – what was what was um?

Mayor Martin – I think the Chief had heard it first hand, think you should get it first hand from the Chief.

Councilor Wainstein – ok would a, let me ask you this question is is it is another definition of bullying “if I don’t get my way I will punish you.” Do you accept that as a definition of bullying?

Mayor Martin – well maybe of intimidation and a that sure stretching the definition of bullying in a number of different directions can encompass a lot of different meanings.

Councilor Wainstein – Ok thank you.

Councilor Renaud – Councilor Pyfrom.

Councilor Pyfrom - Well a quick question, you had mentioned once before that you have an open door policy that any Councilor can come see you at any time to discuss anything. Is it still an open door policy.

Mayor Martin - oh ya ya.

Councilor Pyfrom – thank you.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass - I’m sorry I want to go back to your story Mr. Mayor. Is is it your position that town employees who have anxiety about bringing their concerns about you to you need therapy in order to learn coping mechanisms so that they can overcome their own insecurities and that they are the problem and there is nothing on you, is that what your trying to express.

Mayor Martin - I think that would be too much of a literal and concrete interpretation of the story I gave Councilor Mass.

Councilor Mass – can you give me a better explanation in more direct terms of what you think the problem is why town employees who have anxiety don’t believe that they can bring those, what, whether or not that anxiety is justified or not, what we can do to help employees overcome that and be able to bring these issues forward so that they can be addressed and don’t you want to know what their concerns are.

Mayor Martin – um you got a couple question there. One of them, we have employee assistance so any employee who is feeling uncomfortable with anybody else should go and become part of the employee assistance program. So that EAP is available through the Human Resource Office, I would go there first.

Councilor Mass - I’m sorry can I ask you a quick follow up to that, Councilor Renaud.

Mayor Martin - Yes

Councilor Renaud - Yes

Councilor Mass - did you offer that advice to the chief of police when he felt bullied by the Town Council President that he should get EAP training? He should seek EAP assistance.

Mayor Martin - a not yet.

Councilor Renaud - President Allis, Councilor Ricketts.

President Allis – I just have one more questions and I I have so many papers hear I forgot that I wanted to ask a question. On number 12 “do you believe you have ever used bullying, intimidation, threats and retribution against any town employee or Town Councilor?” and you answered “no”. Was there any point on May 16th that you went to see a Town Council at his place of business of this past year. Do you remember that, did that happen?

Mayor Martin - I’ve been to Bill’s.

President Allis – yup, anybody else?

Mayor Martin - I’ve been to Dan’s.

President Allis – ok so you, do you, do you, do you recall that possibly going to Councilor Leonovich’s was on the 16th one day prior to our budget vote. Do you recall that?

Mayor Martin - nope.

President Allis – you don’t recall that, so you wouldn’t recall what you told him then.

Mayor Martin - was I wor an article

President Allis – I don’t believe

Mayor Martin – a vote coming up on a Town Council

President Allis – I don’t believe I don’t believe it was an article; I didn’t put an article on. I’m just I’m just wondering if you remembered because I know that Councilor Leonovich does and he may want to speak about that so.

Mayor Martin – he may, I know I’ve been down there five six times

President Allis – ok so, if he wants to talk about that he will. Would it surprise you to know that starting on the 18th of May which is one day after the budget vote from May 18th to 10-24 he received 12 parking tickets and there was only written on Deerfield Street? Would that surprise you?

Mayor Martin – I don’t know any amount on any street.

President Allis – ok so you don’t know any amount, so, if if that were in fact the case do you think that might be intimidation, the the all of those parking tickets issued to a Councilor who voted to cut your budget would be intimidation, do you think that could possibly be intimidation? When 65% of the tickets issued were issued to the Councilor.

Mayor Martin – well I think percentages are always dangerous to use but if there’s 12 out of 20 you said.

President Allis – yup.

Mayor Martin – so um were all the 20 violations?

President Allis – all the 20 were vi, ya I have the report hear if you would like to see it.

Mayor Martin – ok so the complete 20 were violations. 12 were in one area.

President Allis – no no no all 20 were in the same area just 12 of them were Councilor Leonovich and it was started the day after our budget vote that was unfavorable to you and the reason you were there on the 16th was to encourage him not to vote a certain way and then he voted the other way than you wanted him to vote. Do you believe that could be viewed as intimidation?

Mayor Martin – I think um, no I don’t.

President Allis – no you don’t, ok

Mayor Martin – no and I think it’s a convenient linkage on you part.

President Allis – Ok

Mayor Martin – I would note that Mr. Leonovich’s neighbor um has had a number of a, if you remember I think we were all on the Council at the same time with um the neighbor and the problems we had with the sidewalk with the the a antiques of sorts were always out and about. So there were a number of fines on that property for maybe a year from the License Commission. Maybe you were on the License Commission (Mayor pointed at Councilor Mass).

Councilor Renaud - Vice-President Mass or Councilor Ricketts

Vice-President Mass – oh sorry I didn’t.

Councilor Ricketts – um I just have to ask when um Dennis Helmus was working in City Hall were there ever any meetings between you and any employee because of bullying.

Mayor Martin – no

Councilor Ricketts – that’s all I had to ask, thanks.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor would it surprise you to learn that prior to that May 16th vote for the six month prior there were no parking tickets issued in that same ar, im sorry

President Allis – years

Councilor Mass – sorry, how many years

President Allis – six years

Councilor Mass – in the prior six years. Would it surprise you to learn that in the prior six years, I'm just saying six months, in the last six years prior to that May 16th vote that there were no tickets issues in that area of concern.

Mayor Martin – I I have, it would surprise me.

Councilor Mass – if if that were in fact the case that for six years no tickets were issued and then a series of 12 tickets were issued following a vote where you who specifically asked someone to vote one way and they voted another way that that might be at least perceived as a bullying tactic.

Mayor Martin – well really Councilor Mass I consider that an innuendo and if there was going to be any type of a accusation of that sort I would go to, I would go to the AG's office or the IG's office or somebody else and make a complaint that the Chief of Police is targeting one particular Councilor because they voted one way or another on a on a bill. So I mean that instead of doing it in a public forum like this and a degrading the Police Chief and staining the a enforcement department of the Town of Greenfield. If you have a serious case like I felt I had a serious case by the present Council President conducting that type of behavior with the Chief of Police send a letter do it directly send a letter to him the Chief of Police and copy the Mayor and go to the AG's office let some other people third party come out here and say is this true. Did Mr. Leonovich was he being intimidated by the Mayor and the Police Chief because he voted, I don't even know what he voted, 1% or was, was that the 1% night

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor your answer was completely nonresponsive. I asked you if, you, it could be, if you believe it could be perceived as intimidation, not what should happen, whether or not you believe it could be perceived as intimidation.

Mayor Martin - no

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor, may I continue to follow up.

Councilor Renaud – ahum (indicating yes).

Councilor Mass – did you contact the Attorney General's Office about the complaint made by the Chief of Police to about the Council President.

Mayor Martin – no

Councilor Mass – and you did bring that out into a public forum by sending a press release to the newspaper, correct?

Mayor Martin – what question are we talking about?

Councilor Mass – the letter that you sent regarding President Allis, you sent that in a public way to the newspaper, that's a public forum right in the newspaper.

Mayor Martin – I agree.

Councilor Mass – ok, so, one last question. Mr. Mayor are you suggesting that the Council should act better than you have behaved.

Mayor Martin – I think the Council contacted the State Auditor maybe the Council should contact the Attorney General and see if there has been a a a some type of a conspiracy going on ticketing in Greenfield.

Councilor Mass – again I think that's nonresponsive but I'm not looking for a response.

Mayor Martin – no I'm serious.

Councilor Renaud – anything else, any other questions, are we ready to move on. Councilor Leonovich.

Councilor Leonovich – it's not so much a question as it's a clarifying point. The time on the 16th when you came down to visit I didn't consider it an intimidating moment but as you were leaving you'd made mention, you said "boy the parking is tight down here", cuz you had a hard time getting in the in the lot. I've heard that comment a thousand times is because the lot is a very awkward lot and I thought nothing of it, until the 18th. It just felt, I I I didn't I actuality even at that point just wanted to keep low and not really participate in thinking or actively think about it in any other way, but looking at the reports of the tickets

first knowing that for six years I'd never received one and then after that a finding out that there were no tickets issued in that area prior to the 18th and then having 12 subsequent. So I don't, I wouldn't call it a bullying tactic I don't think it was I I I just looking back I feel like it was more of a shot across the bow, I don't know what other way to put it. It just feels like it looking at the paperwork now and just seeing the the concentration of tickets, it just, I think from any objective person looking at it it would at least "poke up" a thought of possibility.

Mayor Martin – Councilor Leonovich um I've been down you've worked on my vehicles and so on. We've talked about how it's crowded and you're so busy and you do great work. We indicated in our conversations that you need a bigger place, did I help you try to find other places and give you suggestions that there might be another building here, there might be some land here, all of maybe a half a dozen different options to help you expand your business.

Councilor Leonovich – absolutely.

Mayor Martin – right and at the time I didn't know you didn't have any tickets there I'm always curious when I park and there's not much room left on the road I park there and um I didn't know you got a bunch of tickets until Councilor Mass told me and he gave me a phone call and said ya know like a heads up all the sudden Dan got a lot of tickets. Um I checked with the Police Chief right away he said there was no extra patrols in ya know around your area, um when the PEO's have time off they go to Beacon they go to Highland they go to Deerfield Street they go all the different places they don't usually get to and if they have time off the ya know maybe they go down Deerfield Street a lot, but it that would be just horrible if anyone planned to do anything like that, um I I'd I just can't believe that anyone would.

Councilor Renaud – President Allis.

President Allis – one more thing, just to clarify your statement a um in question number a four, maybe not four, its four and a couple of other ones whichever one we want to take; were you also informed by the Police Chief that part of the conversation that we had on the phone included talking about the, my perceived misuse of how the parking enforcement were going in-tandem that I witnessed four times in a vehicle to go ticket a a other lots. And that that I explained to him that it seems like it's a waste of town resources to have people going in-tandem and it looks bad. Did he relay that to you.

Mayor Martin – ya a did later on he did

President Allis – later on, ok.

Mayor Martin – um but, ya know I remember when um a particularly it might have been a couple dozen years ago we were doing the a conserving gasoline, up several years ago and the strategy for conserving gasoline was putting more than two people in a vehicle; instead of having one person in a vehicle and having two vehicles out on the street. So we've done that in the past in the town. I've I a I think a if I recall a conversation with the Chief he's said that there would be there would be sometimes when it's a weather or other types of a lifting might be involved or two people would be in a vehicle, so I don't know.

President Allis – ok so did he also explain that I specifically told him that it was one person driving and one person got out checked a car got back in and drove away, did he explain that to you at all. Cuz that was also in our conversation.

Mayor Martin – no he didn't explain that.

President Allis – ok, so I I just wanted to make that very clear that the the only, first of all there was no threat of defunding based on the fact that I got a parking ticket, that did not happen. My conversation of about funding was specifically to the fact that it appears that if we have people chauffeuring each other we have too many people in that department. That's what I said. And I believe that people would agree that if we are having people chauffeur other people that that is a waste of resources.

Mayor Martin – are you aware of the Executive Order.

President Allis – which Executive Order?

Mayor Martin - the Executive Order a dealing with the communications between the Legislative and Executive.

President Allis – the a one where you prohibit a citizen from talking to their town department head?

Mayor Martin – ya an elected official for orderly conduct a to move communication from the legislature to the executive side.

President Allis – um I I the one that I recall and I don't really have to answer your questions, but I will, is that as a citizen and as someone who pays taxes and votes and lives in Greenfield; I have equal access to anybody that works for the town as any other person would have. He could have not taken my phone call.

Mayor Martin – I I I think I'm specificity talking about the a detailed conversations you have about the um microbe structure of departments, so, to make comments ah without going through a process and getting an explanation making a case and then asking a question, defining a problem and trying to design the solution and getting a question answer back with the department though any other means rather than going to people and saying I don't like the way your working.

President Allis – I I simply expressed my concerns prior to this conversation, I I expressed my concerns about that and I did not receive an answer back, I I I, I received an "non" answer back and that's, I let it go that was fine, but I, in the time that I was speaking with the Chief it that is what came up so there was no, there was no, I didn't threaten to cut funding because I got a parking ticket which is what is being eluded to by you. I said that if we have resources that are not being used properly that maybe there are too many people and maybe they need less budget, ok, so. I just want to ask one last question, you are aware that any vote takes a majority, correct, so anything that I say, I I I can unilaterally cut anything, you do understand that, correct.

Mayor Martin – made a noise indicating yes.

President Allis – ok, so any vote that's taken requires a majority so I don't understand how it can be perceived that "I" could cut a budget because "I" cannot cut a budget. So that's my last thing.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass

Councilor Mass – Mr. Mayor can you tell us, absent the veto acceptance under the Charter what authority you have to issue any Executive Order controlling the conduct of the, of any Councilor.

Mayor Martin – I don't believe any.

Councilor Mass – I think that correct and that's why I think your, your Executive Order hold no weight with Councilors who who reach out to department heads, you certainly do have the ability to control the the prioritization of work of department, of employees. To that end, is it fair to say that there is a finite number of parking enforcement officials? There is only so many of them.

Mayor Martin - made a noise indicating yes.

Councilor Mass – and is it fair to say that the parking enforcement officials prioritize their tasks based on what is most important; the most important goals of the department?

Mayor Martin – ya I would say so.

Councilor Mass – and is it fair to say that if that staff were reduced, less important enforcement would not happen. Or would be more limited.

Mayor Martin – ya, I would have to analyze that, we only have one full time person and three part time people.

Councilor Mass – they can't be everywhere all the time

Mayor Martin – right

Councilor Mass – and so if there's less of them they'll be less tickets issued, is that correct?

Mayor Martin – well if there are no parking enforcement officers there would be no tickets.

Councilor Mass – ya, and if there were only one there would be less then there are now?

Mayor Martin – I I think that's logical.

Councilor Mass – and so if a Councilor disagrees with a policy, the way parking enforcement policy is being enforced one method to change that policy absent, without your cooperation, would be to work with their colleagues to cut that department so that you didn't have the resources to enforce that policy, isn't that correct.

Mayor Martin – I would think so and that would happen in a subcommittee. What subcommittees do you would expect that would happen at?

Councilor Mass – A, I would expect that would happen during the budget Your Honor I mean Mr. Mayor. The, so isn't it completely appropriate for a Councilor to lay out their full intent to work towards a resolution of a policy matter through other met, the other methods that are available to them if they are not able to get your cooperation on changing that policy. Isn't that a, isn't that the right of the Council.

Mayor Martin – I think it’s a responsibility of the Council to deal with the budget matters in committee not on the street or direct intimidation to the department head or anyone else.

Councilor Mass – and and Mr. Mr. Mayor do you think any, that is ok to communicate with you about individual Councilors thoughts and goals?

Mayor Martin – why wouldn’t why wouldn’t any Councilor come forward and and offer some ideas.

Councilor Mass – so if my idea is that you shouldn’t enforce parking in a certain method that would be an appropriate thing to bring to you, correct.

Mayor Martin - made a noise indicating yes.

Councilor Mass – and it would likewise be appropriate for me to bring to you the thought that if you were to disagree with that I might try to achieve that through other means

Mayor Martin – a oh in committee, I mean that’s

Councilor Mass – as the Council as a whole

Mayor Martin – legislature operates as a Council in subcommittees

Councilor Mass – and and you don’t believe that I as Councilor Allis said as an individual Councilor, I’m sorry Councilor Renaud this is my last question, you don’t believe that I have the power unilaterally to do it without the cooperation of the full Council, or majority of the Council at least.

Mayor Martin – Well, when President Allis said that, probably not, he sits as the President, doesn’t vote often unless it’s a tie, everyone has their own influence on the Council, but when you say it its different.

Councilor Mass – how is that?

Mayor Martin – um because you you um say to people that you can swing the votes, you can get the votes, you can guarantee the votes.

Councilor Mass – so so the only difference is that I’m compelling.

Mayor Martin – no, the difference is that you’re not the President.

Councilor Mass – ok

Mayor Martin – You’re not the President of the Council.

Councilor Mass – Ok thank you.

Councilor Renaud – thank you Vice-President Mass. Mayor Martin I think you can um, you’re all set, i think you can be excused. Audrey I think you’re next.

Ms. Tuttle asked Audrey LaBonte: Raise your right hand, do you swear to tell the truth the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help you God.

Mrs. LaBonte - I do.

Mrs. LaBonte read the attached “Exhibit B.”

Councilor Renaud – thank you, does anybody have any questions, any follow up questions pertaining specificity to the questions that Audrey answered. Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass – I defer to President Allis.

Councilor Renaud – President Allis.

President Allis – I don’t have a question I just want to say I’m sorry I didn’t bring you up first

Mrs. LaBonte – thank you.

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass – Mrs. LaBonte just one question, had I been to the Mayor's office previous to my meeting with you. Do you remember.

Mrs. LaBonte – a bazillion times.

Councilor Mass – a let me say I didn’t vote to have you subpoenaed here today and I apologize that you had to come in.

Councilor Renaud – are there any other questions? Thank you.

Councilor Ricketts – that was worth the wait huh?

Chuckling laughter from some attending.

Councilor Renaud – Chief Haigh.

Ms. Tuttle asked the Police Chief Robert Haigh: Raise your right hand, do you swear to tell the truth the whole truth and nothing but the truth so help you God.

Chief Haigh - I do.

Councilor Mass- point of order.

Councilor Renaud – yes Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass- um I think Madam, Treasurer Renaud um, I believe employees who are subpoenaed are um permitted to have Counsel present with them to advise them in answer questions. However I believe that Counsel needs to be paid for individually. Can you inquire of the Chief of Police who how whos sitting with him, what in what and in what capacity, who retained them, how it's being paid.

Man with Chief Haigh – you can ask but we are not telling ya.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Mass, second by Councilor Ricketts, it was,

MOVED: MOVE TO ADJOURN.

DISCUSSION: Councilor Renaud asked if there was any discussion over the motion to adjourn. President Allis stated he would like to ask his questions but acknowledged the questions would be met with the same candor we just received the answer with.

Councilor Mass withdrew his motion.

Councilor Mass made a further point of order to Councilor Renaud noting only people permitted within the rail are the employees being questioned and their privately paid Counsel. He asked; because we do not know who the individual is that that person be removed from the rail and if they don't voluntarily leave that the Deputy Chief of Police to remove him. Councilor Mass explained what the "rail" was. Councilor Ricketts asked President Allis if he was ok asking the questions without knowing who the man was with Chief Haigh. President Allis stated not knowing who he was didn't bother him but was bothered by not knowing if the person was being paid by the town. The man with Chief Haigh identified himself as Austin Joyce. Councilor Renaud stated she was inclined to proceed. Councilor Mass made a further point of order asking if the Rules of Procedures should be suspended in order to allow an unidentified or identified only by name, no residents or position to remain within the rail.

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Ricketts, second by Councilor Wainstein, it was by majority, 1 no, 1 abstention,

VOTED: SUSPEND THE RULES OF PROCEDURE.

Chief Haigh – read the following questions and answers:

1. On what date were you aware of President Allis family hospital situation?
 - a. I don't recall the actual date that debt, they went to the hospital are no on November 1 at 844 hours I was told about the situation with the child
2. Did you e-mail your letter addressed to President Allis at his home address prior to sending it to the town clerk?
 - a. No, asked the Clerk to send it.
3. Did you send a letter to anyone out? If so, to whom a date you send it?
 - a. I sent it to Mark Smith on October 26, 2017 and Deb Tuttle on November 3, 2017 and the Mayor's Office on November 3, 2017.
4. What do you believe is the definition of bullying behavior?

- a. I have the bullying statute for what we deal with in my world under the a school bullying, do you want me to read the whole thing,

Councilor Renaud – Um

President Allis – I would like to hear that.

Councilor Renaud – um

Chief Haigh – otherwise I don't have an opinion on that.

Councilor Renaud – yes, could you read the whole thing, how how big is it?

Chief Haigh – it's the criminal statute that we deal with, otherwise I don't have a personal opinion

Councilor Renaud – no a i think that's ok.

Someone unidentified – why don't you just read the citation.

Chief Haigh – Bullying is the repeated use by one or more, oh I'm sorry (laughing), the statute is the MGLA of 71 section 370 which is the school bullying prohibited.

5. Do you believe that a Town Councilor questioning effectiveness of a department head in discussing concerns in relationship to funding is always an attempt to bully?
 - a. No.
6. What are the policies in place for the parking enforcement department relative to processing ticketing visitors? (please provide the policy for you as well as the date the policy was created)
 - a. A there is no specific policy on the issuance of tickets at this time.
7. Is parking permit it in areas that are not marked "no parking" but are within the areas where there are marked spaces? Example: can a vehicle and be parked legally even in the spot is not marked for parking but is otherwise a legal place to park?
 - a. Yes.
8. In the last two years have you ever been asked by any City Council are devoid of a parking ticket outside the proper appeals process than any citizen is expected to follow?
 - a. No.
9. In last year's two years have any dispatchers giving to you directly, or left for you, in any area of the Police Department including but not limited to your mailbox or the parking appeal tray any parking tickets issued a City Councilors to be voided?
 - a. Yes.
10. Is there any instance where parking ticket would be voided without going through the proper appeals process?
 - a. Yes.
11. Did President Allis asked you to avoid a parking ticket (outside the proper process provided to any recipient of a parking ticket? That he received on October 24, 2017?
 - a. No.
12. On the telephone call of October 24, 2017, the President Allis ask you why he was ticketed on Deerfield Street when the illegal parking on Bank Row is ignored by you?
 - a. His interpretation of illegal but yes.
13. Have you ever been instructed by the Mayor to instruct the parking enforcement not to ticket certain people/places?
 - a. People no, vehicles are issued tickets, places yes.
14. Have you ever instructed the parking enforcement not to ticket certain people/places absent any other from the Mayor to do so?
 - a. People no, vehicles are issued tickets, places yes.
15. If the vehicle is in violation of any parking regulations and parking enforcement officers use discretion and choose which vehicles they do and do not ticket?
 - a. There is discretion, I'm sorry there can be discretion.

16. To your knowledge how many times did President Allis contact either you or the Police Department about the parking issue on Bank Row from October 1, 2017 up to and including October 24, 2017?
 - a. Two or three.
17. How many other than inquiries have been made either to you personally or to the Police Department through the dispatch department?
 - a. Not sure what inquiries that refers to is my answer.
18. In your opinion do you truly believe that President Allis bullied you on the telephone, and if so would you believe he was trying to accomplish?
 - a. I never used the word bully and I can't speculate what his motivation was.
19. Why was your email sent to the Town Clerks Office at 2:44 PM on November 3, 2017 after the fact the Mayor sent his about half an hour prior?
 - a. That was when I saw the email from the Mayor's office to do so.
20. How did the press get the emailed letter if the Town Clerk was out of the office and was unable to forward the email?
 - a. A member of the Recorder went to the Town Hall themselves and obtained my letter from there.
21. Why was a letter sent to the press just before the Town Elections?
 - a. Don't know, I sent mine to the Town Clerk.
22. Describe the events that you were involved in what led up to and one mentioned in the mayor's letter to President Allis and Vice-President Mass on November 3, 2017.
 - a. On October 24 I had a phone call from Councilor Allis, later that night I encountered Councilor Allis at Fosters Market, on October 25 I wrote the letter to the Councilor and sent it to the office of the Mayor through Mark Smith. On October 26th it was decided to await for the Mayor's return to address my concerns. I was out of town until the night of October 30th. On the morning of October 31st I met with the Mayor about my concerns and the letter. At that time I was told of the interaction with Councilor Mass on a prior date with Ms. LaBonte. After our conversation I left, I didn't have any personal interaction with the Mayor until November 3rd. I received the email from his office to send my letter to the Clerk, I emailed my letter to the Clerk, asked it to be sent to Councilor Allis and the Council some time after 3:00 pm, I was contacted by the Recorder asking about a comment from the letter from the Mayor that referenced my letter. I advised I'd have to call back I had not read the Mayor's letter and that I would only comment, and that I wouldn't give my letter, um and that would have to be done through a public records request. After reading the Mayor's letter I called the Recorder back to answer the questions and to advise that Councilor Allis did not ask me to fix the ticket. Um I was asked if a who who obtained the letter and I was told from the Town Hall.
23. Did you feel bullied by anyone at any time? If yes please describe.
 - a. No
24. Do you feel someone in a position of power was abusing that power and how?
 - a. Id refer back to to a to number 25 which is the next the next one.
25. Is there anything else you think we should know or is there anyone else we should talk to you?
 - a. Um I don't think there is anyone else you should talk to but I I felt on a I should at least note that on Oct on a November 14th Councilor Allis did contact one of my day Sergeants directly at the Police Department to gather information for him in regard to parking. This request had already been put in to the, through the Clerk's Office, was my understanding who had contacted my Lieutenant to address the request we were sending somebody over to address it a I felt that this was a possibility to inadvertently put one of my officers in a bad position who could have unknowingly violated a code of conduct a unintentionally. I felt it, that the Council President placed that officer in a bad position. That's it.

Councilor Renaud – ok um before we go forward I just kinda want to recalibrate everybody to why we are here. So this is an investigation into the allegations of bullying and everything surrounding those allegations. Um we still, it is almost were its 11:30 at night we still have to talk amongst ourselves because at the end of the day were going to have to decide if this rises to the um rises to an ethics violation. So um please think about that when you're asking your questions and where we go from here. The Police Chief has just answered all of his but I'd ask that you'd try to to long of a back and forth, back and forth, um, and with that Brickett, President Allis.

President Allis – you can call me Brickett that's fine. I don't know if you can see from there, but this is the letter you wrote, is that correct, I mean I can have it brought up, I mean it, it is addressed to me at my home address, is that correct. If you can't see it I can maybe have Mark bring it up. It's dated the 26th and addressed to me at my home address, is that correct.

Chief Haigh – that's correct.

President Allis – ok, is there a reason that, and there is no cc on the bottom, is that correct?

Chief Haigh – correct.

President Allis – ok, so would you typically when writing a letter to someone would you cc would you put a cc on it and mail it to the address that you put on it, or would you put the address on it and send it somewhere else.

Attorney Joyce – How is that related to.

Councilor Renaud – I'm sorry sir you cannot answerer the question it has to be Chief Haigh.

Attorney Joyce – don't answer the question.

President Allis – ok, that's fine, thank you, that's fine, no answer is as good of an answer as I can expect. Um ok, so just for the record it was not sent to my home address it was not mailed it only sent on November 3rd. Um ok, in front of you there's a stapled packet of papers with a bunch of pictures on it and I'll try to save enough time by maybe having you stipulate to some of the facts that are in the picture. Exhibit 1, do you see it there is it still on the table, or did the Mayor grab it, ya, so Exhibit 1, on the first page, is that in fact a no parking with an arrow, can you tell, cuz if not I can go to another clearer picture.

Chief Haigh - I know what sign it is.

President Allis – ok so you do agree that it is a no parking sign and there are cars parked underneath it.

Chief Haigh - sure

President Allis – ok, thank you, appreciate it. Um as the supervisor for the parking enforcement department and as you stated there was discretion, do you believe that on the 14 dates of these pictures that there was discretion used in not ticketing any of those vehicles.

Chief Haigh - not going to answer that question.

President Allis – you're not going to answer that question, ok so, this is a report that you sent me that goes from 10-1 to 11-13 and this is just for Bank Row parking. There were on October 10th there was four tickets issued for meter violations on Bank Row none for restricted parking. On October 27th there was two tickets issued for meter violations none for by um restricted parking. On the 30th of October there was four tickets issued for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the 31st of October there was three tickets issued for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the November 1st there was two tickets issued for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the November 2nd there was six tickets issued on Bank Row for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the November 3rd two tickets were issued on for meter violations and none for restricted parking. On the November 6th there were four tickets issued for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the 7th there was one ticket issued for meter violations none for restricted parking. On the 8th three for meter violations none for restricted parking. Now without going through each picture separately there is an array of violations and approximately a thousand dollars worth of revenue lost by not ticketing those vehicles. Um a another reason why I was upset about the parking department and the amount of resources we spend on them if they are not going to ticket a people on the park and the reason I know those tickets were issued is because this report shows the time and the date that those parking enforcement officers were on Bank Row and would have seen the cars parked there and the tickets weren't issued. So I think the answers I'm going to get are "I'm not going to answer that" so um I will continue to ask my questions in hopes that I get an answer. Um, do you oh I can't ask that

question because I forgot to put it down so I won't ask that. Um, I never asked you to fix my ticket, is that correct? I never asked you to fix the ticket without going through the appropriate process, is that correct?

Chief Haigh – I already answered that.

President Allis – ok you answered that. So the answer to that is yes. Um was that ticket subsequently appealed.

Chief Haigh - yes

President Allis – yes, and was that ticket subsequently was the appeal subsequently granted.

Chief Haigh - yes

President Allis – yes. In a conversation that you referenced with the day sergeant I'd like to touch on that because I did ask for the codes, I re, I asked for a report and thank you for getting the report so quickly. I did receive the reports, I received the violation numbers and I need to know what the violations numbers were. Um I did go through the Clerk's Office to have those violation numbers explained to me. The parking enforcement sent over a parking enforcement officer who was unsure how to use the handheld device that they issue tickets on and could not give us codes out of the device and told the Clerk that he was not the person to ask; even though he was the person sent over to show us what the codes were or at least tell us what the codes were. So, yes I did, I did in fact contact the day Sergeant, who I am a personal friend of, um and just simply asked him what the codes were because they used to write tickets, the police department used to write the tickets. Um If I I got him in trouble because he gave me something that should be public knowledge, my apologizes for that. Um it is my opinion if we are going to be ticketing people there should be on file what those violations are and how much they are for. Um it it sound, it seem to me and and in my letter of response it seems to me that the department um has some things that they are lacking in and I'm not sure why um that oversight is lacking. Um with that said um I I appreciate you're your maneuvering around the questions I um would have hoped that given the fact that my family was in the hospital and she works for you that you could have told the Mayor that maybe it was a bad time, but if you didn't than you didn't. Um I would have gladly um had any conversation about this, I would I would have had zero problem with this if these letters hadn't been cloaked by the fact that the Clerk was out of the office and sent to her while she was not there in a position that I was in. I would have been happy if I could have looked in my email when Aviva called me and said "oopp there it is I missed it" but instead it looks and appears to the *Recorder* and to everyone who received the letters that a it was sent to me on the 26th, which it was not, because that's the date on it. Um in in in business when I write a letter and I put someone's address and name on it I send it to that address and name and if it's going to someone else I would cc them. So I appreciate you coming and answering the questions. I have nothing else. Thank you .

Councilor Renaud – Vice-President Mass.

Councilor Mass – Thank you Councilor Renaud. Chief I think you answered this I just want to be completely clear on this. You repeatedly said that "people don't get tickets, vehicles get tickets" did you ever instruct anyone not to ticket a specific vehicle or vehicle registered to a specific person.

Chief Haigh – no.

Councilor Mass – ok I didn't think so I just wanted to be clear because the way of your your um answer. Are you're personally responsible for the review of the parking ticket appeals.

Chief Haigh – yes.

Councilor Mass – and you you may not recall this, do you recall the parking ticket appeal of Mr. Kenneth Lane. And it that's ok if you don't.

Chief Haigh – I cannot answer that.

Councilor Mass – do do you recall the Mayor bringing to your attention ticketing of, um ticketing of the, ticketing enforcement policy on in permitted lots on weekends. do you remember a conversation with the Mayor about that. Did he ever discuss that with you?

Chief Haigh – Can, if if your, if this is in regard to Saturday permit

Councilor Mass - Ya

Chief Haigh – being allowed, I mean I was at that parking commission meeting

Councilor Mass – ya

Chief Haigh – when that was brought up

Councilor Mass – did he talk to you prior to the meeting

Chief Haigh – a its quite possible I mean we talk all the time

Councilor Mass – do you know who made that decision to start ticketing on weekends

Chief Haigh – we are not ticketing on weekends it was the reverse. They were getting tickets on Saturdays. We said no the permits were good for Saturday now.

Councilor Mass – ok

Chief Haigh – it was actually the reverse

Councilor Mass – so how is it that people got tickets on Saturdays and appeals were filed and they were denied.

Chief Haigh – when you have a permit you still, I don't know what the reason would be, but if you have a permit you still have to park in a permitted spot, for your lot that you are in.

Councilor Mass – ok

Chief Haigh – so if you had a blue permit you still couldn't park in a red permit on Saturday.

President Allis – it's on the table.

Councilor Mass – there is a copy of Mr. Lang's reply there, do you see.

Attorney Joyce – that's as far as were going with that, no.

Councilor Mass – do you see the reason, the thee your finding related to Mr. Lang's on the table. Do you see it? You don't see it.

Chief Haigh - I didn't look at it.

Councilor Mass – could you look at it for us.

Chief Haigh – its quiet possible it was before the date that was determined.

Councilor Mass – ya, so so what I'm trying to get to the bottom of and I'm not blaming anyone I'm just trying to figure out how it happened. Is there was a policy that we didn't ticket people then we started ticketing people and then we had a, there was a meeting where they reversed that policy again, and went back to the original policy. Do you know who made the decision to start ticketing people in between?

Chief Haigh – I'm not even sure what your referring to for the before. I mean when I was dealing with it it was ticketing on Saturday and then it wasn't, it was it was determined, I don't know what the date was I can't tell you right now when that meeting was.

Councilor Mass – it it would be helpful to me, I don't expect you to have the answer today, but perhaps you can provide it to the Council in the future whether or not we ticketed permit holders for being in permitted lots on weekends prior to 2000, January 2017, If if you can find that information that would be helpful. I'm trying to sort of aside from the bullying think trying to get to the bottom of how these policy changes happen without anyone sort of knowing what's going on the Mayor didn't seem to know so I'm just trying to figure out how that happens, thank you those are the only questions I have.

Councilor Renaud – does anybody have any questions directly related to the investigation? Councilor Sund.

Councilor Sund – this is um just um not a, somebody was just wondering if there, how much it cost for meters on certain part of Main Street and what's not.

Councilor Renaud – Councilor Sund I, Id, could we, I appreciate the question but could we do it at the next Council meeting, it's um, just we want to stick, so, you could be excused Chief Haigh.

Councilor Ricketts – thank you.

Councilor Mass – Treasurer Renaud is it possible to recall the Mayor at this time for a question.

Councilor Renaud – I would rather not.

Councilor Mass – I think I think it's an important question and I think the Council for budgetary reasons needs to know.

Councilor Renaud – I think this meeting though is for the investigation and I think we've gone a little off, off the track

MOTION: On a motion by Councilor Mass, second by Councilor Ricketts, it was,

MOVED: TO APPEAL THE DECISION OF THE PRESIDING OFFICER.

DISCUSSION: Councilor Mass stated the question for the Town Council was if the Town Council wished to recall the Mayor.

It was unanimously,

VOTED: TO APPEAL THE DECISION OF THE PRESIDING OFFICER AND RECALL THE MAYOR.

Councilor Renaud – Mr. Mayor.

Councilor Mass - Mr. Mayor I only have one question for you. Did you, no I only have one question, did you; you are the only person authorized to hire Council on behalf of the Town. Did you authorize the hiring of Counsel for representation of any party before, as in relations to these proceedings?

Mayor Martin – no.

Councilor Mass – thank you Mr. Mayor.

Councilor Renaud – Thank you Vice-President Mass for keeping that brief. Um and I want to say although it looked like it went off the rails every now and then I understand that some of these questions and I don't know if the listening audience really understands that um that things were relevant though at times they might not seemed like it. Um so um with that said I think we can switch seats again.

President Allis – yes we can.

Councilor Renaud – and then we can discuss.

President Allis – thank you Treasurer Renaud for, um sitting in for me, I appreciate your um willingness to do that.

President Allis resumed the Chair. Councilor Renaud noted her intention for the investigation was to determine if the Council wanted to write to the State Ethics Commission asking them to investigate either Town Council leadership, the Mayor, the Police Chief or anyone else involved or just acknowledge the bad behavior. Comments included:

- Unsure of the intention for the meeting.
- Too much nonsense; this meeting was worse than the last one.
- If this was really a point of ethics, people should just go the State Ethics Committee; the Town Council should not do this.
- This did not provide any service to the taxpayer.
- The community now knows the facts from all sides; let's wrap this up and move forward.
- Don't see this as an ethical violation just rude behavior.
- This should not have been brought up to the public; it should have been a conversation between the Mayor, Police Chief and the President.
- The Town Council did not make this a public issue.
- President Allis has owned his actions and apologized.
- Ms. LaBonte stated she did not feel bullied by Vice-President Mass.
- Concerned that the Mayor doesn't recognize that people feel bullied by him.
- One on one is better than it is now.

President Allis adjourned the meeting at 12:07 PM.

A true copy,

Attest: _____
Deborah J. Tuttle, Town Clerk

GREENFIELD TOWN COUNCIL MEMBERS

GCTV-15
 Special Meeting
 November 29, 2017

Attendance

1. Sund, Verne	Y					
2. Lobik, John	Y					
3. Allis, Brickett	Y					
4. Muzyka-Pyfrom, Wanda	Y					
5. Wainstein, Robert	Y					
6. Burge, Maria	Y					
7. Childs, William	Y					
8. Vacant	---					
9. Leonovich, Daniel	Y					
10. Mass, Isaac	Y					
11. Renaud, Karen	Y					
12. Ricketts, Penny	Y					
13. Maloni, Mark	N					